

**U.S. District Court  
District of Columbia (Washington, DC)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:17-cv-00390-CKK**

JAMES MADISON PROJECT et al v. DEPARTMENT OF  
JUSTICE et al  
Assigned to: Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly  
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 03/03/2017  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of  
Information Act  
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

**Plaintiff**

**JAMES MADISON PROJECT**

represented by **Bradley Prescott Moss**  
LAW OFFICES OF MARK S. ZAID, P.C.  
1250 Connecticut Avenue, NW  
Suite 700  
Washington, DC 20036  
(202) 454-2809  
Fax: (202) 330-5610  
Email: [brad@markzaid.com](mailto:brad@markzaid.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**NOAH SHACHTMAN**

represented by **Bradley Prescott Moss**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

V.

**Defendant**

**DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE**

represented by **Matthew Joseph Berns**  
NEW JERSEY DEPARTMENT OF LAW  
AND PUBLIC SAFETY  
Richard J. Hughes Justice Complex  
25 Market Street  
8th Floor, West Wing  
Trenton, NJ 08625-0080  
(202) 616-8016  
Fax: (202) 616-8470  
Email: [matthew.j.berns@usdoj.gov](mailto:matthew.j.berns@usdoj.gov)  
*TERMINATED: 02/08/2018*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Vinita B. Andrapalliyal**  
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE  
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch  
1100 L Street NW  
Washington, DC 20005  
(202) 305-0845  
Fax: (202) 616-8470  
Email: [vinita.b.andrapalliyal@usdoj.gov](mailto:vinita.b.andrapalliyal@usdoj.gov)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND  
SECURITY**

represented by **Matthew Joseph Berns**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 02/08/2018*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Vinita B. Andrapalliyal**  
 (See above for address)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
03/03/2017	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE ( Filing fee \$ 400 receipt number 0090-4863750) filed by THE JAMES MADISON PROJECT, NOAH SHACHTMAN. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Rule 7.1 certification, # <u>2</u> Civil Cover Sheet, # <u>3</u> Summons DHS, # <u>4</u> Summons DOJ, # <u>5</u> Summons USADC, # <u>6</u> Summons USAG)(Moss, Bradley) (Entered: 03/03/2017)
03/03/2017		Case Assigned to Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly. (zsb) (Entered: 03/03/2017)
03/03/2017	<u>2</u>	SUMMONS (4) Issued Electronically as to DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, U.S. Attorney and U.S. Attorney General (Attachment: # <u>1</u> Consent Form)(zsb) (Entered: 03/03/2017)
03/06/2017	<u>3</u>	ORDER Establishing Procedures for Cases Assigned to Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly. Signed by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly on March 6, 2017. (NS) (Entered: 03/06/2017)
03/23/2017	<u>4</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Matthew Joseph Berns on behalf of DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE (Berns, Matthew) (Entered: 03/23/2017)
03/28/2017	<u>5</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer re <u>1</u> Complaint, by DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Berns, Matthew) (Entered: 03/28/2017)
03/29/2017		MINUTE ORDER: The Court is in receipt of Defendants' <u>5</u> Consent Motion, which requests an extension of time for Defendants to respond to the Complaint. For good cause shown, the Consent Motion is GRANTED. Defendants shall answer or otherwise respond to the Complaint by MAY 12, 2017. Signed by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly on 3/29/2017. (lcckk1) (Entered: 03/29/2017)
03/29/2017		Set/Reset Deadlines: Answer due by 5/12/2017. (dot) (Entered: 03/30/2017)
05/08/2017	<u>6</u>	Consent MOTION for Leave to File <i>First Amended Complaint</i> by JAMES MADISON PROJECT, NOAH SHACHTMAN (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum in Support, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A – First Amended Complaint, # <u>3</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Moss, Bradley) (Entered: 05/08/2017)
05/10/2017		MINUTE ORDER: The Court is in receipt of Plaintiffs' <u>6</u> Motion for Leave to File First Amended Complaint, which requests leave to file an amended complaint in this action, and indicates that Defendants do not oppose this relief. This Motion is GRANTED, as the Court finds that "justice so requires." Fed. R. Civ. P. 15(a)(2). Plaintiffs' First Amended Complaint, ECF No. 6-2, is deemed filed as of this date. Signed by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly on 5/10/2017. (lcckk1) (Entered: 05/10/2017)
05/10/2017	<u>7</u>	FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT against DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE filed by JAMES MADISON PROJECT, NOAH SHACHTMAN.(znmw) (Entered: 05/11/2017)
05/24/2017	<u>8</u>	ANSWER to <u>7</u> Amended Complaint by DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. Related document: <u>7</u> Amended Complaint filed by NOAH SHACHTMAN, JAMES MADISON PROJECT. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 – OLC Request, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2 – DHS Request, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3 – TSA Request, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4 – CBP Request, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5 – ICE Request, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6 – USCIS Request)(Berns, Matthew) (Entered: 05/24/2017)
05/31/2017	<u>9</u>	ORDER. The parties shall file a schedule not later than JUNE 7, 2017. Signed by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly on 5/31/2017. (lcckk1) (Entered: 05/31/2017)

05/31/2017		Set/Reset Deadlines: Parties shall file a scheduled by 6/7/2017. (dot) (Entered: 06/06/2017)
06/05/2017	<u>10</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Joint Status Report</i> by DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Berns, Matthew) (Entered: 06/05/2017)
06/06/2017		MINUTE ORDER: The Court is in receipt of Defendants' <u>10</u> Consent Motion for Extension of Time to File Joint Status Report. For good cause shown, that Motion is GRANTED. The parties shall file the Joint Status Report by JUNE 16, 2017. Signed by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly on 6/6/2017. (lcckk1) (Entered: 06/06/2017)
06/06/2017		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 6/16/2017. (dot) (Entered: 06/07/2017)
06/16/2017	<u>11</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Berns, Matthew) (Entered: 06/16/2017)
06/21/2017		MINUTE ORDER: The Court is in receipt of the parties' <u>11</u> Joint Status Report, which indicates that Defendants have initiated searches for documents, and that some responsive materials have already been produced, and that the parties are conferring regarding the remaining issues in this matter. Accordingly, the parties shall file a further status report by JULY 21, 2017, updating the Court regarding the status of document productions, and proposing a briefing schedule, if necessary. Signed by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly on 6/21/2017. (lcckk1) (Entered: 06/21/2017)
06/21/2017		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 7/21/2017. (dot) (Entered: 06/21/2017)
07/21/2017	<u>12</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by JAMES MADISON PROJECT, NOAH SHACHTMAN. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Moss, Bradley) (Entered: 07/21/2017)
07/27/2017		MINUTE ORDER: The Court is in receipt of the parties' <u>12</u> Joint Status Report, which indicates that Defendants have initiated searches for documents, and that some responsive materials have already been produced, and that the parties are conferring regarding the remaining issues in this matter. Accordingly, the parties shall file a further status report by SEPTEMBER 5, 2017, updating the Court regarding the status of document productions, and proposing a briefing schedule, if necessary. Signed by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly on 7/27/2017. (lcckk1) (Entered: 07/27/2017)
07/27/2017		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 9/5/2017. (dot) (Entered: 07/28/2017)
09/05/2017	<u>13</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Berns, Matthew) (Entered: 09/05/2017)
09/20/2017		MINUTE ORDER: The Court is in receipt of the parties' <u>12</u> Joint Status Report, which indicates that Defendants have initiated searches for documents, and that some responsive materials have already been produced, and that the parties are conferring regarding the remaining issues in this matter. Accordingly, the parties shall file a further status report by NOVEMBER 6, 2017, updating the Court regarding the status of document productions, and proposing a briefing schedule, if necessary. Signed by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly on 9/20/2017. (lcckk1) (Entered: 09/20/2017)
09/20/2017		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 11/6/2017. (dot) (Entered: 09/20/2017)
11/06/2017	<u>14</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Berns, Matthew) (Entered: 11/06/2017)
11/20/2017		MINUTE ORDER: The Court is in receipt of the parties' <u>14</u> Joint Status Report, which indicates that Defendants have initiated searches for documents, and that some responsive materials have already been produced, and that the parties are conferring regarding the remaining issues in this matter. Accordingly, the parties shall file a further status report by <b>JANUARY 19, 2018</b> , updating the Court regarding the status of document productions, and proposing a briefing schedule, if necessary. Signed by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly on November 20, 2017. (lcckk1) (Entered: 11/20/2017)

11/20/2017		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 1/19/2018. (dot) (Entered: 11/22/2017)
01/19/2018	<u>15</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Berns, Matthew) (Entered: 01/19/2018)
02/08/2018	<u>16</u>	NOTICE OF SUBSTITUTION OF COUNSEL by Vinita Balakrishnan Andrapalliyal on behalf of DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE Substituting for attorney Matthew J. Berns (Andrapalliyal, Vinita) (Entered: 02/08/2018)
02/28/2018		MINUTE ORDER: The Court is in receipt of the parties' <u>15</u> Joint Status Report, which indicates that Defendants have been reviewing and producing documents on an ongoing basis. As part of this process, "the parties have conferred about the scope of Plaintiffs' requests, and Plaintiffs have agreed to certain limitations or clarifications of their scope." The Court adopts the parties' proposal that they file a further status report by <b>MARCH 20, 2018</b> , updating the Court regarding the status of document productions, and proposing a briefing schedule, if necessary. Signed by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly on February 28, 2018. (lcckk1) (Entered: 02/28/2018)
02/28/2018		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 3/20/2018. (dot) (Entered: 02/28/2018)
03/20/2018	<u>17</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Andrapalliyal, Vinita) (Entered: 03/20/2018)
04/12/2018		MINUTE ORDER: The Court is in receipt of the parties' <u>17</u> Joint Status Report, which indicates that Defendants have been reviewing and producing documents on an ongoing basis. The Court adopts the parties' proposal that they file a further status report by <b>MAY 21, 2018</b> , updating the Court regarding the status of document productions, and proposing a briefing schedule, if necessary. Signed by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly on April 12, 2018. (lcckk1) (Entered: 04/12/2018)
04/12/2018		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 5/21/2018. (dot) (Entered: 04/12/2018)
05/21/2018	<u>18</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Andrapalliyal, Vinita) (Entered: 05/21/2018)
05/21/2018		MINUTE ORDER: The Court is in receipt of the parties' <u>18</u> Joint Status Report, which indicates that Defendants have been reviewing and producing documents on an ongoing basis. The Court adopts the parties' proposal that they file a further status report by <b>JULY 23, 2018</b> , updating the Court regarding the status of document productions, and proposing a briefing schedule, if necessary. Signed by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly on May 21, 2018. (lcckk1) (Entered: 05/21/2018)
05/21/2018		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 7/23/2018. (dot) (Entered: 07/09/2018)
07/23/2018	<u>19</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Andrapalliyal, Vinita) (Entered: 07/23/2018)
08/02/2018		MINUTE ORDER: The Court is in receipt of the parties' <u>19</u> Joint Status Report, which indicates that Defendants have been reviewing and producing documents on an ongoing basis. The Court adopts the parties' proposal that they file a further status report by <b>SEPTEMBER 24, 2018</b> , updating the Court regarding the status of document productions, and proposing a briefing schedule, if necessary. Signed by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly on August 2, 2018. (lcckk1) (Entered: 08/02/2018)
08/02/2018		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 9/24/2018, updating the Court regarding the status of document productions, and proposing a briefing schedule, if necessary. (dot) (Entered: 08/02/2018)
09/24/2018	<u>20</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Andrapalliyal, Vinita) (Entered: 09/24/2018)
10/09/2018		MINUTE ORDER: The Court is in receipt of the parties' <u>20</u> Joint Status Report, which indicates that Defendants have been reviewing and producing documents on an

		ongoing basis. The Court adopts the parties' proposal that they file a further Joint Status Report by <b>NOVEMBER 27, 2018</b> , updating the Court regarding the status of document productions, and proposing a briefing schedule, if necessary. <b>The parties shall continue to submit further Joint Status Reports every sixty days thereafter, unless and until the Court orders otherwise.</b> Signed by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly on October 9, 2018. (lcckk1) (Entered: 10/09/2018)
10/09/2018		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 11/27/2018, updating the Court regarding the status of document productions, and proposing a briefing schedule, if necessary. (dot) (Entered: 10/10/2018)
11/27/2018	<u>21</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Andrapalliyal, Vinita) (Entered: 11/27/2018)
01/29/2019	<u>22</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Andrapalliyal, Vinita) (Entered: 01/29/2019)
03/28/2019	<u>23</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Andrapalliyal, Vinita) (Entered: 03/28/2019)
05/28/2019	<u>24</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Andrapalliyal, Vinita) (Entered: 05/28/2019)
07/30/2019	<u>25</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Andrapalliyal, Vinita) (Entered: 07/30/2019)
07/31/2019		MINUTE ORDER: The Court is in receipt of the parties' latest <u>25</u> Joint Status Report, which indicates that Defendants have been reviewing and producing documents on an ongoing basis. However, the Office of Legal Counsel's productions to date have not been updated since the prior <u>24</u> Joint Status Report, contrary to the Court's expectation because OLC "has been making approximately monthly productions." The parties' next Joint Status Report shall include an OLC update. The Court adopts the parties' proposal that they file a further Joint Status Report by <b>OCTOBER 1, 2019</b> , updating the Court regarding the status of document review and productions, and proposing a briefing schedule, if necessary. That Joint Status Report shall tightly summarize what the parties have previously reported to the Court and shall focus the Court's attention on Defendants' latest progress in review and production. Defendants also shall identify anticipated timelines for concluding their productions in this case. <b>The parties shall continue to submit further Joint Status Reports every sixty days thereafter, unless and until the Court orders otherwise.</b> Signed by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly on July 31, 2019. (lcckk1) (Entered: 07/31/2019)
07/31/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 10/1/2019, updating the Court regarding the status of document review and productions, and proposing a briefing schedule, if necessary. (dot) (Entered: 08/02/2019)
10/01/2019	<u>26</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Andrapalliyal, Vinita) (Entered: 10/01/2019)